NTSB ID: DCA04MA068

Aircraft Registration Number: N586P

Occurrence Date: 08/13/2004

Most Critical Injury: Fatal

Occurrence Type: Accident

Investigated By: NTSB

Location/Time

Nearest City/Place
Florence
State
KY
Zip Code
Local Time
0049
CDT

Airport Proximity: Off Airport/Airstrip
Distance From Landing Facility: 2

All port Proximity. Off Airport/Airstrip

Aircraft Information Summary

Aircraft Manufacturer Model/Series Type of Aircraft

Convair Div. of Gen. Dynamics CV-340 (580) Airplane

Revenue Sightseeing Flight: No

#### Air Medical Transport Flight: No

#### Narrative

Brief narrative statement of facts, conditions and circumstances pertinent to the accident/incident:

\*\*\* Note: NTSB investigators traveled in support of this investigation and used data obtained from various sources to prepare this aircraft accident report. \*\*\*

The Board's full report is available at http://www.ntsb.gov/publictn/publictn.htm, AAR-06/03, PB2006-910403.

On August 13, 2004, about 0049 eastern daylight time,1 Air Tahoma, Inc., flight 185, a Convair 580, N586P, crashed about 1 mile south of Cincinnati/Northern Kentucky International Airport (CVG), Covington, Kentucky, while on approach to runway 36R. The first officer was killed, and the captain received minor injuries. The airplane was destroyed by impact forces. The flight was operating under the provisions of 14 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Part 121 as a cargo flight for DHL Express2 from Memphis International Airport (MEM), Memphis, Tennessee, to CVG. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the flight, which operated on an instrument flight rules flight plan.

The flight crew was scheduled to fly the accident airplane on a roundtrip sequence from MEM to CVG.3 Flight 185 departed MEM about 2329. The first officer was the flying pilot, and the captain performed the nonflying pilot duties. During postaccident interviews, the captain stated that the takeoff and climb portions of the flight were normal.

According to the cockpit voice recorder (CVR) transcript, at 0017:49, the captain stated that he was just going to "balance out the fuel here."4 The first officer acknowledged. From 0026:30 to 0027:08, the CVR recorded the captain discussing the airplane's weight and balance with the first officer. Specifically, the captain stated, "couldn't figure out why on the landing I was out and I was okay on the takeoff." The captain added, "the momentum is one six six seven and I...put one zero six seven and I couldn't work it." He then stated, "so...we were okay all along."

At 0030:40, the first officer stated, "weird." At 0032:31, the captain stated, "okay just let me finish this [the weight and balance paperwork] off and...I'm happy," and, about 2 minutes later, he stated, "okay, back with you here." At 0037:08, the captain contacted Cincinnati Terminal Radar Approach Control (TRACON) and reported an altitude of 11,000 feet mean sea level.6 About 1 minute later, the first officer stated, "something's messed up with this thing," and, at 0039:07, he asked "why is this thing?" At 0041:21, the first officer stated that the control wheel felt "funny." He added, "feels like I need a lot of force. it is pushing to the right for some reason. I don't know why...I don't know what's going on." The first officer then repeated twice that it felt like he needed "a lot of force." The CVR did not record the captain responding to any of these comments.

At 0043:53, when the airplane was at an altitude of about 4,000 feet, the captain reported to Cincinnati TRACON that he had the runway in sight. The approach controller cleared flight 185 for a visual approach to runway 36R and added, "keep your speed up." The captain acknowledged the

FACTUAL REPORT AVIATION NTSB ID: DCA04MA068

Occurrence Date: 08/13/2004

Occurrence Type: Accident

#### Narrative (Continued)

clearance and the instruction. The first officer then stated, "what in the world is going on with this plane? sucker is acting so funny." The captain replied, "we'll do a full control check on the ground." At 0044:43, the approach controller again told the captain to "keep your speed up" and instructed him to contact the CVG Air Traffic Control Tower (ATCT).

At 0045:11, the captain contacted the CVG ATCT and requested clearance to land on runway 36R, and the local control west controller issued the landing clearance. Flight data recorder (FDR) data indicated that, shortly afterward, the airplane passed through about 3,200 feet, and its airspeed began to decrease from about 240 knots indicated airspeed. At 0045:37, when the airplane was at an altitude of about 3,000 feet, the captain started the in-range checklist,8 stating, "bypass is down. hydraulic pressure. quantity checks. AC [alternating current] pump is on. green light. fuel panel. boost pumps on."

About 0046, the first officer stated, "I'm telling you, what is wrong with this plane? it is really funny. I got something all messed up here." The captain replied, "yeah." The first officer then asked, "can you feel it? it's like swinging back and forth." The captain replied, "we've got an imbalance on this...crossfeed I left open." The first officer responded, "oh, is that what it is?" A few seconds later, the first officer stated, "we're gonna flame out." The captain responded, "I got the crossfeed open. just keep power on."

At 0046:45, the CVR recorded a sound similar to decreasing engine rpm. Immediately thereafter, the first officer stated, "we're losing power." At 0046:52, the first officer stated, "we've lost both of them. did we?" The captain responded, "nope." FDR data showed that, about 1 second later, a momentary electrical power interruption occurred when the airplane was at an altitude of about 2,400 feet. At 0046:55, the CVR stopped recording. Airplane performance calculations indicated that, shortly after the power interruption, the airplane's descent rate was about 900 feet per minute (fpm).

According to air traffic control (ATC) transcripts, at 0047:12, the captain reported to the CVG ATCT that the airplane was "having engine problems." The local control west controller asked, "you're having engine problems?" The captain replied, "affirmative." At 0047:28, the controller asked the captain if he needed emergency equipment, and the captain replied, "negative.'" This was the last transmission received by ATC from the accident flight crew. The FDR continued recording until about 0049. The wreckage was located about 1.2 miles short of runway 36R.

#### FINDINGS

- 1. The captain and first officer were properly certificated and qualified under Federal regulations.
- 2. No evidence indicated that flight crew fatigue was a factor in this accident, and no evidence indicated any preexisting medical or behavioral conditions that might have affected the accident flight.
- 3. The airplane was properly maintained in accordance with Federal regulations and approved company procedures.
- 4. The recovered components showed no evidence of any preexisting powerplant, system, or structural failures. No evidence indicated that any of the airplane's cargo shifted during the flight.
- 5. Neither the weather nor the inoperative distance measuring equipment on the Cincinnati/Northern Kentucky International Airport very high frequency omnidirectional range was a factor in this accident.
- 6. Sufficient fuel was on board the airplane for the flight from Memphis International Airport to Cincinnati/Northern Kentucky International Airport.

NTSB ID: DCA04MA068

Occurrence Date: 08/13/2004

Occurrence Type: Accident

Narrative (Continued)

- 7. The captain's preflight weight and balance calculations indicated that the airplane was not within takeoff limits; therefore, he should not have allowed the airplane to take off. However, the captain's calculations were incorrect, and the airplane's weight and balance were within limits.
- 8. The captain did not recognize the importance of the cues provided by the first officer, and he failed to perform expected pilot-in-command duties.
- 9. The captain was preoccupied with the weight and balance calculations during critical portions of the flight and, as a result, he did not monitor the fuel crossfeed operations, which resulted in a fuel imbalance and unusual airplane handling characteristics.
- 10. The flight crew did not monitor the fuel quantity gauges or respond properly to the airplane's changing handling characteristics, and the captain did not start the in-range checklist at the appropriate altitude; as a result, the crew missed several opportunities to identify the ongoing fuel crossfeed operations and determine that the airplane's fuel was imbalanced.
- 11. Although fuel transfer is prohibited on the Convair 580 airplane, fuel transfer can occur during fuel crossfeed operations if the fuel tank shutoff valve for the tank not being used is left open.
- 12. All of the fuel from the airplane's left tank that was not used by the engines transferred into the right tank because the captain intentionally kept the right fuel tank shutoff valve open during fuel crossfeed operations, which was not in accordance with approved fuel crossfeed procedures.
- 13. During the airplane's descent to landing, the fuel in the left fuel tank, which was providing fuel to both engines, was exhausted because both engine-driven fuel pumps drew air from the left tank into the fuel system instead of fuel from the right tank, resulting in a dual-engine flameout.
- 14. Fuel transfer can occur on the Convair 580 airplane if it is operated with different fuel boost pump output pressure settings and with the fuel crossfeed valves unintentionally left open.
- 15. The accident investigation would have benefited from the retrofit of an independent cockpit voice recorder power source and a cockpit image recorder.

NTSB ID: DCA04MA068

Occurrence Date: 08/13/2004

FACIDAL REPORT	unchice Date. 00/13/2004												
AVIATION		rence Type											
Landing Facility/Approach Info	rmation												
Airport Name		Airport ID:	Airport Elevation	Run	way Used	Runwa	ay Lengt	th R	lunwa	y Width			
CINCINNATI/NORTHERN KENT		CVG	896 Ft. MSI	_ 36	R	R 10000			150				
Runway Surface Type: Concrete													
Runway Surface Condition: Dry													
Approach/Arrival Flown: Visual													
VFR Approach/Landing: None													
Aircraft Information													
Aircraft Manufacturer			/Series					Number	Number				
Convair Div. of Gen. Dynamics	Cv-3	40 (580)				68							
Airworthiness Certificate(s): Transpo	ort												
Landing Gear Type: Retractable - T	- Γricycle												
Amateur Built Acft? No N	Certifie	d Max Gross Wt.	54600 LBS Numbe			r of Engines: 2							
Engine Type: Turbo Prop	Engine Ma Rolls-Ro	nufacturer: yce	Model/Series: 501-D13				Rated Power: 3750 HP						
- Aircraft Inspection Information													
Type of Last Inspection			Date of Las	t Inspection	Time Since Last Inspection				Airframe Total Time				
Continuous Airworthiness			07/2004				Но	Hours 67948.9 Hours					
- Emergency Locator Transmitter (EL	.T) Information												
ELT Installed?/Type No			ELT Operated? No ELT Aided in Locating Accident Site						? No				
Owner/Operator Information													
Registered Aircraft Owner			Street Address										
N580, Inc			City								Zip Code		
			Spanaway										
Operator of Aircraft			Street Address										
AIR TAHOMA INC			City Columbus						State OH	2	Zip Code		
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code: I5HA											
- Type of U.S. Certificate(s) Held:													
Air Carrier Operating Certificate(s): F	lag Carrier/Dom	nestic; S	Supplemer	ntal									
Operating Certificate:				Operator Certifi	cate:								
Regulation Flight Conducted Under: I	Part 121: Air Ca	rrier											
Type of Flight Operation Conducted:	Non-scheduled;	Domes	stic; Cargo	)									
	I	FACTU	AL REPO	RT - AVIATION							Page 2		

NTSB ID: DCA04MA068

Occurrence Date: 08/13/2004

AVIATION				Occurren	Occurrence Type: Accident									
First Pilot	Information			<u>'</u>										
Name				City					Sta	te	Date of Birth	Age		
On File												On File	49	
Sex: M		Certificate Number:												
Certificate(s): Airline Transport; Flight Engineer; Foreign; Private														
Airplane Ra	ating(s): Multi	i-engine Laı	nd; Single-e	ngine Land										
Rotorcraft/0	Glider/LTA: None	e												
Instrument	Rating(s): Airpl	ane												
Instructor F	Rating(s): None	е												
Current Bie	nnial Flight Revie	ew? 07/200	4											
Medical Cert.: Class 1 Medical Cert. Status: With Waivers/						tions			D	ate of La	ast Me	edical E	xam: 04/2004	ļ
- Flight Tim	ne Matrix	All A/C	This Make and Model	Airplane Single Engine	Airplane Mult-Engine	Ni	Night Actual		Instrument al Simulated			Rotorcraft	Glider	Lighter Than Air
Total Time		2500	1337											
Pilot In Cor	nmand(PIC)		88								_			
Instructor						+			_		$\perp$			
Instruction						-			_		4			
Last 90 Day								-		+				
Last 30 Day		20				+			-		+			
Seatbelt Us		·	l ulder Harness	Used? Yes			Toxico	logy Pe	erformed? Yes			Se	I econd Pilot? Y	es
Flight Pla	n/Itinerary													
	ht Plan Filed: <b>IF</b>	R												
Departure F	Point						State	,	Airport	port Identifier Departure Time Tir			Time Zone	
Memphis							TN		MEM					
Destination							State	,	Airport Identifier				<u> </u>	
Same as Accident/Incident Location									cvg					
Type of Cle	earance: IFR													
Type of Air	space:													
Weather	Information													
Source of \	Wx Information:													
	Comm	ercial Weat	ther Service											
				FACTUAI	REPORT	- AVI	ATION	1						Page 3

NTSB ID: DCA04MA068

Occurrence Date: 08/13/2004

	С	Occurrence Type: Accident											
Weather	AVIATION Information												
WOF ID	Observation Time	Time Zone	wo	F Elevation	on	WOF D	WOF Distance From Accid				Direction From Accident Site		
	0050			Ft.	MSL			NM		Deg. Mag.			
Sky/Lowes	t Cloud Condition:						Ft. AG	Condition of Light:					
Lowest Cei	iling: Overcast			7500 Ft. /	4GL	Visib	ility:	10	0 SM A		meter:	30.02	"Hg
Temperature: 13 °C Dew Point:				11 °C	Weath	her Condi	tions at Accid	dent S	ite: Visual (	Conc	ditions		
Wind Direc	etion:	Wind Sp	eed:			Wind	d Gusts:						
Visibility (R	RVR): Ft.	Visibility	(RVV)		SM								
Precip and/or Obscuration:  No Obscuration; No Precipitation													
Accident	Information												
Aircraft Dar	mage: Destroyed		Ai	Aircraft Fire: None					Aircraft Exp	losio	n None		
- Injury Sur	mmary Matrix	Fatal	Serious	Minor		None	TOTAL						
First Pil	lot				1		1						
Second	l Pilot	1					1						
Student	t Pilot												
Flight Ir	nstructor												
Check F	Pilot												
Flight E	ngineer												
Cabin A	Attendants												
Other C	Crew												
Passen	gers												
- TOTAL A	ABOARD -	1			1		2						
Other G	Ground	0		0	0		0						
- GRAND	TOTAL -	1		0	1		2						

National Transportation Safety Board

### FACTUAL REPORT AVIATION

NTSB ID: DCA04MA068

Occurrence Date: 08/13/2004

Occurrence Type: Accident

							•			
$\Lambda$	വന	ını	ıctı	rativ	10	Ini	-Crr	nat	ınr	١
$\neg$	иш	11 11	เอเ	auv	/ =	11 11	UII	Hai	IUI.	ı

Investigator-In-Charge (IIC)

Joseph M. Sedor

Additional Persons Participating in This Accident/Incident Investigation:

Tony James AAI-100, Washington, DC

Brian Mathis Air Tahoma

Matt Palmberg Kelowna Flightcraft LTD.

Rick Thorpe Rolls-Royce Corporation

David McNair Transportation Safety Board of Canada